



DEPARTMENT OF THE AIR FORCE
HEADQUARTERS 95TH AIR BASE WING (AFMC)
EDWARDS AIR FORCE BASE CALIFORNIA

Nov. 17, 2011

MEMORANDUM FOR SEE DISTRIBUTION

FROM: 95 ABW/CEVR

SUBJECT: Minutes of the Environmental Restoration Program, Restoration Advisory Board
(RAB) Meeting, 17 February 2011

1. Time: 1738
2. Place: Mojave, California
3. Chairman: Mr. Peter Zorba, Public Co-chair/Lancaster Public Representative
4. The following RAB members were present:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Position</u>
Col Jose Torres	Air Force Co-chair
Mr. Bruce Davies	North Edwards Public Representative
Mr. Kevin Depies	California Environmental Protection Agency (Cal/EPA) Department of Toxic Substances Control (DTSC) Remedial Project Manager (RPM)
Mr. Ai Duong	Edwards Air Force Base (AFB) RPM
Mr. Bill Gaddis	Rosamond Public Representative
Dr. Joseph Healy, Jr.	United States Environmental Protection Agency (U.S. EPA) RPM
Mr. Milton McKay	Air Force Research Laboratory (AFRL) Public Representative
Mr. Patrick Morris	Edwards AFB Housing Public Representative
Mr. Tim Post	Lahontan Regional Water Quality Control Board (LRWQCB) RPM
Mr. Richard Salazar	Edwards AFB Main Base Test Wing Public Representative
Mr. Robert Smith	California City Public Representative
Dr. Leslie Uhazy	Rosamond Public Representative (Alternate)
Ms. Brenda Weems-Hunter	Edwards AFB South Base Public Representative
Mr. Victor Yaw	Mojave Public Representative

5. The following members were absent:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Position</u>
Mr. Marvin Crist	Lancaster Public Representative (Alternate)
Ms. Julie English	Boron Public Representative
Mr. James Ricks	U.S. EPA RPM

Mr. John Steude	LRWQCB RPM
Ms. Nancy Zimmerman	Edwards AFB Main Base Air Base Wing Public Representative
Vacant	Edwards AFB North Base Public Representative
Vacant	National Aeronautics and Space Administration (NASA) Public Representative

6. The following advisors were present:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Organization</u>
Mr. Joseph Dunwoody	95 ABW/CEVR
Ms. Patrice Hallman	95 ABW/CEVR
Ms. Rebecca Hobbs	95 ABW/CEVR
Mr. Tom Merendini	95 ABW/CEVR
Mr. Bruce Oshita	95 ABW/CEVR
Mr. Paul Schiff	95ABW/CEVR
Dr. Stephen Watts	95 ABW/CEVR

7. Others present were as follows:

<u>Name</u>	<u>Organization</u>
Mr. Ranney Adams	AFRL Environmental Manager
Mr. Todd Battey	AECOM Technical Services, Inc.
Ms. Kate Blais	95 ABW/PA
Ms. Viola Cooper	U.S. EPA
Ms. Cheryl Herbert	JT3
Mr. Jun Kumazawa	Mojave (Public)
Ms. Patti Kumazawa	JT3/CH2M HILL (Recorder)
Ms. Leilani Richardson	JT3/CH2M HILL
Mr. Paul Rogers	JT3/CH2M HILL

8. Mr. Zorba read the *Statement of Purpose and Conduct*. Mr. Zorba introduced Mr. Gaddis as the new primary public representative for Rosamond.

9. Mr. Zorba presented the 18 November 2010 RAB meeting minutes for acceptance. The minutes were accepted as presented.

10. New Business—*Changing the Face of RAB Meetings* (attachment 1). Mr. Duong stated that the RAB support budget has been cut by 50 percent this year. With the budget shortfall, Edwards AFB cannot continue the current level of support for the RAB. Mr. Duong said the Air Force is trying to find different ways to communicate and get information to and from the RAB. Edwards AFB welcomes any suggestions, but they must fit into the budget. Mr. Duong introduced Ms. Herbert from JT3.

a. Ms. Herbert stated that the base is looking into only hosting two RAB meetings per year. She presented a list of options (attachment 1, slide 3), including expanding the RAB online into social media, specifically Facebook. Ms. Herbert gave a brief overview of Facebook’s features.

She said the pages are currently not available to the general public and may change based on the RAB's requirements. Ms. Herbert introduced Ms. Richardson.

b. Ms. Richardson conducted a live demonstration and tour of the Facebook pages developed for the RAB (attachment 1, slides 6–17). Her demonstration included photos, live chat, online presentations, and discussion boards. Depending on the base acquiring server space, photos, documents, the *Report to Stakeholders* (RTS) may be available from the site. Ms. Richardson added that the RTS is going electronic and people can subscribe to the online version delivered via e-mail.

c. Mr. Duong stated that Facebook is only one of the options the Air Force is investigating and is looking for RAB input. He also said that the base needed to find a way to cut costs with the RTS and going electronic is one option, but it is open for discussion.

d. Col Torres stated that social media allows people to get information at times convenient for them. Anyone can access that information at any time. Base restoration officials will still hold a couple of meetings every year. The base is open to any and all suggestions.

e. Ms. Weems-Hunter said she uses the online version of the RTS, but wants to be able to distribute it outside of Facebook. There are many people who do not use Facebook, and some people still need to learn how to use it. Electronic versions would cut costs. The RAB would need a training course on Facebook.

f. Mr. Gaddis asked whether the primary reason for the Facebook presence was for the RAB or the public. Mr. Duong said that it depends on the RAB. The charter and bylaws would have to be changed to reflect the RAB's wishes for the Facebook presence.

g. Ms. Richardson said that there is a way to set up a group page so only certain Facebook members can view it.

h. Mr. Gaddis said there is a benefit to having the page accessible only to RAB members, in conjunction to having input from the public. He also mentioned that it may create extra work for RAB members if two pages needed to be checked on a regular basis.

i. Mr. Zorba said that changes were inevitable, given progress. There is value in change; however, the RTS is a fantastic vehicle for the RAB, the base and the Air Force, in general, in that it disseminates information on the environmental restoration efforts at the base. The RTS also shows other facets of environmental interests on the base that are not well known to the public. The RTS is a great public outreach tool. Mr. Zorba suggested that, if the color version cannot be maintained because of the budget, the frequency of publication either be reduced to quarterly or the quality reduced. There are a number of RAB constituents that do not use Facebook, including himself, or any other type of social media, and who would prefer something they could hold in their hands. Therefore, a disservice would be done by eliminating all hardcopy versions of the RTS. If the number of meetings is reduced to two per year, the RAB will survive, especially if the electronic means exist to communicate and transfer information. Mr. Zorba noted that the agenda states the next meeting is 16 February 2012. He would like to shift the meeting schedule to a fall and spring cycle. Potential on-base meetings are a great idea

and feasible for those who already have base access. However, base access for members of the public would need to be made available to anyone who wishes to attend the meeting.

j. Ms. Herbert said that the base is working on a marketing campaign, which includes sending postcards to everyone on the current RTS mailing list, informing them that the publication is going electronic and reminding them to sign up. There has been discussion of cutting the number of printed copies from 6,500 to half or less.

k. Mr. Smith stated that he knows his city council receives the hardcopy of the RTS, and if the RTS was only electronic, the council would not receive it. Therefore, it is important to keep some hardcopies. He concurs that, with two meetings a year, Facebook would be essential.

l. Mr. Depies clarified with Mr. Zorba that, by simplification, Mr. Zorba meant changing the RTS to a newsletter format (black and white) and publishing on a quarterly basis. Mr. Depies said he had expected members not to be agreeable to semiannual meetings. The RAB meetings are a way for information to be disseminated. Without the meetings, there would be very little interaction, however, Facebook does appear to be a positive communication tool for the board. In order to move forward, Mr. Depies feels that the RAB needs to see how information can be disseminated through this social format in gaining RAB input.

m. Ms. Richardson gave an example of information exchange by accessing the restoration program manager report through Facebook. Members would be able to access the slides while meeting online and using the live chat feature in Facebook. Salient points could be put into the discussion section on Facebook, people could comment, and project managers could respond.

n. Mr. Zorba said that the information provided in the program manager reports is very concentrated and complicated. If someone with no environmental background was reviewing those reports, it would be hard for them to understand. A PowerPoint presentation is not enough; something like a conference call online or a video would be more effective. Items to illustrate the information, such as narrated videos of sites, graphics, and maps, would be crucial for understanding.

o. Dr. Watts said that the Air Force has created a video on Site 25 that sounds like what Mr. Zorba is describing.

p. Ms. Weems-Hunter was not aware that hardcopies of the RTS were going away. She believes the RTS is a valuable tool for getting the word out. She wanted to know if the Air Force had investigated the cost of video conferencing, and if a change to videos or social media would cost more to do than regular meetings.

q. Mr. Zorba was not sure about costs for the printing of 6,500 copies of the RTS versus shooting a video.

r. Ms. Herbert gave the example that someone could create a video on a cell phone and upload it to the Facebook page. There is no cost to do that, unless it is done professionally, with graphics and editing. To keep costs down, the basic visual idea can be presented.

s. Mr. Duong said that the RTS is open for discussion. The RAB members and the public really like it. Based on the budget, perhaps the RTS can be prepared bimonthly or quarterly. Mr. Duong agreed with Mr. Zorba that many members of the public do not have computer access or use electronic media. Mr. Duong will look at the budget and try to accommodate RTS needs.

t. Mr. Gaddis agreed that the cost of posting on Facebook is minimal. But if this is not a task the Air Force is already doing, there will be cost in terms of time and money. The RAB members need to discuss these factors.

u. Ms. Cooper introduced herself as the community involvement coordinator for the U.S. EPA. She stated that she was a regular user of Facebook. She asked if RAB Facebook discussions would be recorded as part of the records or minutes. The base and RAB members need to be thinking about factors such as these, which would be a big change. Edwards AFB is not the only installation where there are RAB cutbacks. Some additional question Ms. Cooper had were: if we have technical documents for the RAB to review, would they be linked to an online information repository? Would the repository be solely for RAB members or would the public have access as well? Ms. Cooper suggested that Edwards AFB should link to local cities' Facebook pages, and that there are a lot of issues that need to be worked out.

v. Mr. Zorba said that he would be interested to see what other bases have done and how successful they have been. The intention is to do the right thing; but if this method has not been successful elsewhere, we have to take that into account. Mr. Zorba said that Edwards AFB has a very different mix of demographics compared to communities elsewhere in California.

w. Col Torres said that if Facebook did not work, the RAB could try something else. The Air Force will do everything possible within the current budget to bring the best product to the RAB.

x. Mr. Merendini introduced the Site 25 video.

y. Mr. Duong said that the video might be one way to present information on Facebook or YouTube. The RAB meetings were moved off base after 9/11, due to increased security measures on base. Meetings may be held on base with advance coordination for RAB members and the public to gain access.

z. Mr. Zorba said that most everyone on the RAB has access to the base. He said members currently take input from the communities and present those issues to the RAB, which may offset the need for the public to be present at on-base meetings.

aa. Mr. Depies said the DTSC public participation specialist was unable to attend the RAB meeting. However, it is Mr. Depies' understanding that the RAB charter states that meetings are open to the public and the public is encouraged to attend. By moving the meetings on base, the RAB would make it difficult for the public to attend and speak at the meetings. There needs to be reconciliation between the guidance [Federal Register] and the charter, if the RAB decides to meet on base.

bb. Mr. Duong clarified that the ability of the public to participate in RAB meetings was expanded in the last update to the charter and bylaws. The current charter incorporates the Federal Register recommendation to allow the public to directly address the board during

meetings. If meetings are moved on base, the Air Force will work on better access for the public.

cc. Ms. Hobbs said that the Rod and Gun Club has been able to sponsor members of the public onto the base. The only responsibility for the members of the public would be to make a telephone call.

dd. Mr. Davies thinks Facebook/social media is a step in the right direction. He does not use it a lot, but is familiar with how to use the site. If the RAB goes halfway, the idea will not succeed. Social media needs to be embraced. He agrees with having two sites—one for the public and one for the RAB. He asked if it was possible to have a public meeting over Facebook. As the RAB representative, he could use the slides online to deal with public questions. After the last RAB meeting, he fielded a lot of questions regarding the perchlorate-contaminated drinking water issue in Barstow. If there was a Facebook site, he could post his constituents' questions online to get immediate answers. He reminded the members of the board that the drinking water wells in North Edwards are the closest off-base wells to the contaminant plumes. Regarding the RTS, RAB members still need something and he agrees with Mr. Zorba. With social media, the RAB can better disseminate the material. Mr. Davies is looking forward to the Facebook effort. It would be interesting to see video of the different sites. The RAB and Air Force need to consider that we are not just doing this for ourselves, but to better serve the public.

ee. Dr. Healy commented on the Site 25 video. He said it is hard to describe the Mojave Desert to people in Washington, D.C. The Site 25 video would give people a much better understanding of the scale of the restoration efforts. He asked about the cost for the Site 25 video because it might be good to have one for every operable unit.

ff. Mr. Duong said Environmental Management received a lot of support from Public Affairs to make the video, and he does not know the real cost of it. If Environmental Management had to contract the video preparation out, it would be cost-prohibitive. If we need something for a specific purpose to support a decision, the Air Force can try to work with the U.S. EPA and provide a video.

gg. Dr. Healy said he has personal experience with YouTube, and he hopes that new media/social media can be introduced in a cost-effective way.

hh. Mr. Duong said that lower quality video may be something the Air Force can do, and would be more interesting.

ii. Ms. Cooper commented that on Facebook, the RAB may get a lot more people interested in the cleanup program and coming to RAB meetings. She wanted to know if an Air Force expert would answer questions posted by the public.

jj. Mr. Duong said he would have one or two people monitoring all comments during regular work hours.

kk. Mr. Zorba reiterated that if Facebook does not work or if there is something better, the RAB can decide to go in a different direction. He thinks the Air Force should hold onto the

RTS, with a reduction in quality. The RAB members seem to be fine with a reduction in the number of meetings.

ll. Mr. McKay said the RTS was black and white 6 or 7 years ago.

mm. Dr. Uhazy said social media does not end up in a trash can like an RTS. It is stored and archived electronically. He said social media would attract a younger, broader audience locally. He added that students can learn a lot from video that they would not pick up from a paper product.

nn. Mr. Duong said his office would put something together and coordinate with RAB members for the next step. The charter and bylaws need to be changed before the RAB can go any further. If RAB members have any further comments, they should send them to Ms. Richardson.

11. Restoration Advisory Board Vacancy Update—Mr. Hatch reported that the vacancies for the NASA and North Base representatives remain open. Advertising continues at those locations. He said that, with Facebook, it will be easier to advertise for open positions. Col Torres said he can facilitate with NASA.

12. Reports from Public Representatives.

a. Mr. Davies, North Edwards, said after the Barstow perchlorate-contaminated drinking water event, he had several people contact him and ask if this type of event could occur at North Edwards. People wanted to know from which direction North Edwards drinking water wells were recharging, because the water level has not changed since the wells were drilled in the 1950s. Mr. Davies said that it was not very clear what happened in Barstow.

b. Mr. Post said that he would discuss the Barstow incident during his report.

c. Mr. Duong said if members had any technical questions, they could contact Environmental Management to get them answered.

d. Mr. McKay, AFRL, has not had any questions from the public. He said his allotment of the RTS could be cut in half because people are not taking them.

e. Mr. Gaddis, Rosamond, said he is looking forward to speaking with the Town Council and the Rosamond Community Services District. He was not aware of the process for distributing the RTS.

f. Ms. Weems-Hunter, South Base, received some questions about the Barstow incident. She has been distributing RTS and said she could use a few more hardcopies for distribution.

g. Mr. Yaw, Mojave, took the RTS to the water district. Some of his coworkers at Edwards AFB have asked him questions that he has been able to answer.

h. Mr. Morris, Base Housing, has not had any questions from residents. He knows that, with the electronic RTS, everyone in base housing could be reached through special e-mail channels.

i. Mr. Salazar, Main Base Test Wing, distributed the RTS and said he would like to continue receiving hardcopies.

j. Mr. Zorba, Lancaster, has been sending out the RTS. He said he could use fewer copies.

k. Mr. Smith, California City, said the RTS copy placed in city council chambers gets read. For him, it's a better way to communicate with his city council. He does not believe the city council members will log onto Facebook, and has not had any queries from citizens.

13. Reports from RPMs

a. Mr. Post, LRWQCB, is the project manager on the Barstow incident. He said it started on 18 November 2010 when personnel from the Marine Corps Logistics Base in Barstow detected perchlorate in routine sampling of their drinking water from their local water purveyor. The personnel contacted their water purveyor, who sampled all their wells and provided bottled water. The governor declared a state of emergency. Of the 19 wells sampled, only 3 had perchlorate detects: one was 100 parts per billion (ppb) and the other two were 6 and 7 ppb. The standard is 4 ppb. The three wells were taken offline and the system flushed out. Water Board staff sampled residential wells and found two residences with 650 ppb and 1,400 ppb. Staff traced the source to a company that had been making pyrotechnics for Fort Irwin in the early 1980s. The production facility was near the Mojave River and the owner's house was on the north side of the river. His widow allowed the U.S. EPA to sample on her property. There was an eyewitness account that after his contract was cancelled, the owner dumped perchlorate on his property. One soil sample was 110,000 ppb—11 percent perchlorate in the soil. The U.S. EPA will do more sampling and a removal action on the soil. The Water Board will evaluate the groundwater. The contaminated wells are offline. He said a fact sheet on the event is available on the Water Board's website.

b. Dr. Healy, U.S. EPA, said he is reviewing two Records of Decision (ROD). One is the Arroyos Groundwater ROD, a large plume descending from the ridge, and the other is a landfill. He is also working on a highly technical document called the *Base-Wide Conceptual Site Model*. The document discusses how the water on base communicates with off-base water. The final copy may be out in about 6 months.

c. Mr. Depies, DTSC, said that he was pleased with the meeting turnout. He stated that it makes the decision-making process easier because he can better understand the public's perspective. Public involvement is critical. He is optimistic that the proposed changes will enhance interactions and input from the RAB and public.

d. Due to time constraints, Mr. Duong's staff did not brief the status of their programs (attachment 2).

14. Col Torres said the next meeting was originally proposed for February 2012, due to lack of funding. There may be other options, depending on inputs the Air Force receives. The next face-to-face RAB may not be until the Fiscal Year (FY) 2012 funding is released. However, the RAB can communicate through social media or on base. The Air Force is committed to providing the public with information on the base's remedial activities.

15. Col Torres announced that he would be moving to a new assignment in the summer.
16. Mr. Duong said the Air Force will send out all options discussed at the RAB meeting. The RAB needs to work on the charter and bylaws, possibly in a special meeting.
17. Dr. Healy suggested that the RAB meet on base to work on the charter and bylaws.
18. Ms. Richardson suggested holding the charter and bylaws working group meeting on the day the regular RAB would have been scheduled in May 2011.
19. Mr. Duong said that Ms. Richardson would contact members to work out the details.
20. Mr. Zorba said that RAB input was crucial to the new direction the board was taking.
21. The next meeting is proposed for FY 2012 (after 1 October 2011; site location is to be determined).
22. Col Torres adjourned the meeting at 1948.

//Signed by Col Amy Arwood for//

//Signed by Bruce Davies for//



JOSE L. TORRES, JR., Colonel, USAF
 Air Force Co-chair
 Restoration Advisory Board

PETER ZORBA
 Public Co-chair
 Restoration Advisory Board

Attachments:

1. Changing the Face of RAB Meetings
2. Reports from Environmental Management Program Managers

DISTRIBUTION:

AFFTC/JA/PA/SE
 95 ABW/CV/EM/JA/PAE
 95 AMDS/SGPB/SGPM
 412 TW/CC
 AFRL/Det 7/SEE
 RAB Members
 Cal/EPA, DTSC
 Cal/EPA, RWQCB
 Kern County Environmental Health Services Department
 U.S. EPA